

# Exploring Consumer Engagement with AI Generated Ads vs. Human-Created Ads: Analysis of Perceived Creativity and Effectiveness in Online Advertising

Abdullah Zafar<sup>1</sup>, Sajid Hussain<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>MPhil Scholar, School of Media Studies, The Superior University, Lahore, Pakistan.

<sup>2</sup>Associate Professor, School of Media Studies, The Superior University, Lahore, Pakistan

Correspondence: [abdullahzafar4696@gmail.com](mailto:abdullahzafar4696@gmail.com)<sup>1</sup>

## ABSTRACT

**Aim of the Study:** The primary purpose of this study was better to understand what consumers' perception relates engagement towards human created ads and AI created ads on the base of creativity and effectiveness in online advertising. This study also considered how creative managers adhere to moral guidelines in AI ads to avoid misleading customers and protect companies from criticism.

**Methodology:** This study was guided by "Technology Acceptance Model" that describes that how consumer engagement depends on perceived usefulness, trust and creativity. The study used purposive sampling and was qualitative in nature. Twelve creative managers from Lahore were chosen who (3 to 15 years experiences) were working in different 360 degree agencies. The data were collected from in depth interviews were examined using thematic analysis to find the significant tools and working process under the remark of creative managers.

**Findings:** The outcomes of this research provided significant AI generated ads are faster, cost-effective, best visually appealing but less emotional and cultural connection. Human creative ads are more trusted, emotionally appealing, originality culture representation and memorable for consumers. The best ads always outcome when AI technology and its tools utilize as supporting tool with human creativity rather than replacing it.

**Conclusion:** Study concluded that Artificial Intelligence in advertising is the most suitable option based on the promotion of the career and increase in efficiency, though it should not be implemented at the expense of integrity, morality, or human connection. In order to make ads reliable, captivating and successful, the agencies must be employing AI in an ethical manner, as per cultural and moral standards, and combine it with human creativity.

**Keywords:** AI Creative Ads, Human Creative Ads, Consumer Engagement, Ethical Advertising.

## Article History

Received:  
October 11, 2025

Revised:  
November 23, 2025

Accepted:  
November 28, 2025

Online:  
December 02, 2025

## 1. INTRODUCTION

Artificial intelligence referd to intelligent machines that assist human work in the same way they do, but also support future workforce development, economic growth, and global competitiveness (Cetindamar et al., 2022; Sestino & De Mauro, 2022).

In the early 1900s, the concept of Artificial Intelligence referred to when people imagined artificial humans in their stories, and also generated machines that looked like humans, this type of innovation made the scientist think that machines may be able to think like the human brain. In 1950, Alan Turing proposed a test to check if a computer system can think. The term “artificial intelligence” was first used in 1955. At this time, AI was used to play games and solve general problems. In the 1970s and 80s, AI helped doctors, businessmen, and other field professionals to solve problems. At the end 20 century, AI became faster, which helped solve the difficult tasks (IBM, 2024). At the end 19 century, AI became faster, which helped solve the difficult tasks (UNCTAD, 2025). The market for AI is predicted to grow to \$4.8 trillion by 2033, making it a cutting-edge technology.

Artificial intelligence has rapidly entered many aspects of daily life due to recent technical advancements. One of the industries that has been affected is advertising where AI is causing tremendous changes. Businesses are currently using AI to build smarter adverts, reach the correct consumer, and improve their marketing strategies. Professionals predict that global spending on AI-based advertising may amount to 1.3 trillion in the decade to come, as compared to the estimated 370 billion in 2022 (Statista, 2023). This growth is an indication of the relevance of AI in the advertising industry (Bloomberg, 2023).

One of the major areas of an advertising company which creates and produces advertisements is the creative department. Together, writers, producers, and artists craft a message that achieves the objectives of the client. Additionally, they design logos, jingles, and slogans. The research department gathers and examines data concerning the target population to assist develop better commercials for the client (Safdar and Zaheer, 2025; Shabir et al., 2017; Blakeman et al, 2022).

### 1.1 Problem Statement

With the introduction of Artificial Intelligence (AI), the media industry in the world, especially online advertising, had changed dramatically. Most leading firms across the globe had shifted the conventional method of advertising through digital media with human-generated advertisements to AI-based advertisements. Through AI advertising, there was automation and a personalized method to efficiently connect with consumers, which was an advantage compared to traditional, human-designed advertisements (Amoah et al., 2024).

But in Pakistan, the use of AI in advertisement is less common. The main reason is that advertising agencies use human-generated advertisements to address the needs of local advertisers, and they do not use the creative capabilities of AI to the fullest (Hunt et al., 2025). Such a shallow adoption of AI in advertisement can lead to a decrease in consumer satisfaction and the decrease in brand benefits. This analysis seeks to address the variations in consumer engagement, perceived creativity and efficacy of ads generated by AI as compared to ads generated by human beings with the objective of comprehending the resultant implication to the advertising sector in Pakistan (Nandita et al., 2025).

These findings examined at whether AI-generated creative ads might eventually take the place of content generated by humans on online platforms (Gu *et al.*, 2024; Wu et al., 2021). Furthermore, this study will offer recommendations concerning how Pakistani advertising agencies might ethically encompass AI-generated advertising into their campaigns (GAO *et al.*, 2024).

### 1.2 Study Objectives

The objective of study was to generally addressed the Consumer Engagement with AI-Generated ads vs. Human-Created Ads: Analysis of Perceived Creativity and Effectiveness in online Advertising"-Lahore.

1. To assess consumer perceptions of AI-generated ads versus human-created ads in terms of creativity and effectiveness.
2. To explore AI-driven creative ads to enhance consumer engagement, surpassing traditional human-created ads."
3. To study whether AI-generated creative ads replaced human-created ads in the future."
4. To propose solutions for Pakistan's advertising agencies to adopt AI-generated ads ethically."

## **2. LITERATURE REVIEW**

This section offers a thorough analysis of the body of research on the subject of the study how consumers evaluate the AI-generated ads versus human creative ads and perceived the creativity and effectiveness in online advertising.

The literature view is divided into eight segments (1) Thinking perception consumers for AI vs. Human online advertising (2) Positive and Negative Impact of AI in Creativity (3) Effectiveness of AI in ads (4) Perception of AI honesty in Advertising (5) Creativity through Human collaboration (6) Engaging Consumers Through AI Innovation (7) Challenges and Limitations of AI Advertising (8) Ethical Considerations and future Advertising which identified gaps in literature view. The main goal is to present an overview of recent knowledge, to underline inconsistencies and gaps and allow for the current study to establish.

John McCarthy first suggested that a machine could replicate all aspects of thinking and learning in 1955, which marked the beginning of the idea of artificial intelligence (Mhlanga, 2020). However, some scholars, such as Haenlein and Kaplan, trace the origins of AI even earlier, to the 1940s. In 1942, science fiction writer Isaac Asimov introduced the idea of intelligent robots in his short story *Runaround*. The term "Artificial Intelligence" was officially coined in 1956 by computer scientists John McCarthy and Marvin Minsky during a conference at Stanford University.

### **2.1 Role of AI in Advertising**

Advertising is a major force in forming cultural values, influencing consumer behaviour, and advancing economic growth. Historically derived by human ingenuity and strategic perception, the marketing sector has witnessed a rapid adoption of machine intelligence (AI), transforming the creation and distribution of commercials. Modern AI-driven advertising uses computational procedures and data analytics to provide highly convincing personalised material at scale. Advertising is positioned as a critical component in communication and identity creation because Rehman et al. (2019) claim that it facilitates communication between individuals and provides information that affects purchasing decisions (Akbar et al. 2025).

AI-based platforms try to give an algorithm that offers personalized content and services for consumers. Consumers often enjoy the personalized recommendations that are provided by AI platforms. Spotify and Netflix resemble the TikTok approach because they deliver content with consumers' preferences. Automated recommendation of content that will create imbalance that cause platform more controllable than users. Considerately choosing content helps to maintain the equality between human and machinery innovations. It gives an opportunity to explore the creative content of ads on social media platforms through AI to engage the consumer behavior (Hyunjin Kang & ChenLou, 2022).

### **2.2 Innovation of AI Tools**

Before AI innovation in advertising agencies face many problems like time consumption more and need high budget for campaign. Today every brand generates different content with fewer budgets with variation of target audience. Today we engage single by single individual target with AI tools. Midjourney (visual images) Elevenlabs (voice over) Runway ML (video editing) and Fotor animaker (animation) and ChatGPT or Deep Seek for Creative Content Writing (EZZAT, 2024).

Government and private Clients switch towards Ai generated creative content that helps to get the national objective of advertising agencies related to SDGs9. Artificial Intelligence is new machinery technology all over the world and it makes easy way human to create and run the business in the market. This Ai technology creates innovation to make better infrastructure in advertising and digital media (Chen,2022). New technology (AI) makes innovation and alters the advertising industry. It also displays that how new innovation change industry way to connected with consumers. This new technology supports online platforms work with effectively and sustainable in advertising agency. Ai also generates more profit then investment that support the advertisers to make sustainable growth in market to capture the consumers.

### ***2.3 AI Assistant in Content Creation***

The second method is content creation in which, AI can improve, edit, and clean content. On an individual level, it can provide personalised material that individuals might find more enjoyable, such as music, movie, games, or news. For instance, It can assist in improve image quality or resolution, create 3d objects from drawings, recommend the video quality provide subtitle in every language on video and auto generate new stories that you want from their softwares like script from ChatGpt images from mid-journey and video from Sora. For smart working, AI has abilities and power to alter global media for better purpose consumers and creators (Baptiste et al, 2022).

According to Akbar et al. (2025) founded in their study humans are more effective than those created by AI at evoking strong feelings in viewers, reflecting culture, and maintaining viewer engagement. Real emotions, realistic tales, and well-known personalities are used in human advertisements to increase emotional impact and foster closer bonds. Even if AI advertisements are visually appealing and well-designed, they are shallow emotionally and culturally. Despite its potential, AI cannot yet fully replace human emotional intelligence and creativity. According to the study, artificial intelligence and humans could collaborate to produce even more successful advertisements. Future studies might examine fusing the visual and aural elements of both ad kinds.

AI generated and human-generated advertisements are similar in many ways. Their goals are to engage audiences, sell goods, and establish brand value using media like newspapers, TV, billboards, and social media. Both kinds carefully position products, target audiences based on their demographics, behavior, and interests, and adjust to market changes, seasonal sales, and consumer preferences. They employ multimodal, such as text, graphics, and audio-visuals, structured formats, visual appeal, but have simple and unambiguous messages. Memorable slogans and striking scenes are used in both human and AI advertisement to make them more engaging; although AI advertisement is more likely to be crisper in color and human adverts are more emotional and narrative.

### ***2.3 Rises of Challenges Through Ai Technology in Media***

According to Trattner et al. (2022), the introduction of AI in online advertisements has both serious challenges and opportunities. AI creates the problem of bias and disinformation, continuity of social networks and filter bubbles despite the simplification of personalization, content generation, and communication with the viewer. Limiting the discussion on the number of opinions, these aspects jeopardize democracy and media trustworthiness. Consequently, they promote the development of ethical AI systems which would balance between technological progress and moral values of justice, responsibility and trust of the population.

Also, diversity and transparency continue to be an issue since the algorithmic processes are complicated and often discriminate against minority groups, low-resource languages, and individuals that have accessibility needs (Dinker et al., 2024). Trattner et al. (2022) claim that due to the prevalence of international networks with AI, these risks compound by placing traditional media in a tenuous state. Consequently, they contribute to the development of ethical AI systems, which combine technological progress and the principles of justice, responsibility, and social trust.

AI is changing advertising by making ads more targeted and automatic, but it also creates ethical problems like unfair bias, privacy issues, manipulation, and lack of openness. These problems can harm consumer trust. To fix this, companies need clear rules, protect privacy, check for bias, and be transparent. Advertising with AI should balance new technology with responsibility so that people's rights and dignity are respected (Nayab et al., 2025).

#### ***2.4 Theoretical Framework***

The Technology Acceptance Model (TAM) had been selected as the most suitable theoretical framework for this research because it offers a strong lens through which one can look at what consumers think of AI-generated ads, AI-human creativity, and the corresponding effectiveness and inventiveness of AI-driven versus human-created ads in online advertising environments. Technology Acceptance Model (Davis (1989) this theory contributes to explanation of many aspects my research from consumer perception, effectiveness, human collaboration with AI to challenges and ethical representation of AI.

Davis (1989) claims that one of the most important models for describing how people adopt and utilise new technology is the Technology Acceptance Model (TAM). It contained two assumptions: (1) users are more likely to engage with a technology if it is perceived as useful (2) acceptance occurs when the technology is believed to be easy to use. First assumption (perceived usefulness) was related to the first study objective to this research that shows how consumers evaluate the usefulness of AI in ads, how these perceptions affect their acceptance of this type of content, and how much trust they have in the organisation as a whole.

Second objective align with second assumption of TAM, Ai creative tools will easy to use for advertising agencies to create unique creative content with less hard work to engage consumers with desire individual content.

Third objective align with second TAM assumptions to explores if AI-generated creative advertising, which simplifies the creative process and demands less human work, can eventually replace human-created ads. Fourth objective will help advertisers meet their expectations for effectively engaging customers in the Pakistani.

### **3. METHODOLOGY**

#### ***4.1 Research Type***

This study employed qualitative technique to collect primary data to investigate consumer perceptions of the effectiveness and originality of AI creativity advertisement versus human creative ads, as well as Creative Managers preserve their agencies and brands from criticism under ethical norms and guidelines. A Exploratory research pattern was used to deeper comprehend the relationship between AI and humans creative ads, as well as to evaluate impact, effectiveness, engagement, problems, and limitations in online advertising.

#### ***4.2 Research Design***

The purposive sampling method was appealed to identify respondents as creative managers from different agencies with experiences of 3 to 15 years. Purposive sampling is a strategy frequently utilised in qualitative research to find and pick individuals or groups that are highly educated or experienced in an area of interest (Palinkas et al., 2015).

#### ***4.3 Sample Size***

Twelve creative managers from creative departments was selected as sample for in-depth interviews to explore their concerns and experiences ,as well as to provide diverse range of opinions for Artificial intelligence content future(AICF) in Lahore advertising agencies . Qualitative study of efficacy comparison between human created images and AI generated images in online advertising; it includes sample size of 25 participants (Sharma et al., 2024). According to study (Hasija &Esper,2025) were

conducted with 10 participants investigate that Transparent and clear AI labeling increases customer trust and acceptance especially when applied by prominent companies.

To ensure more diverse viewpoints, improve data depth, and strengthen the validity of thematic conclusions, this study included 12 creative managers. To get more accurate range of perspective from (bachelors to masters) educated creative managers with high AI tool expertise in 360 degrees ads agencies of Lahore. Sample selection is on the bases of AI utilization to modify and develop ads in creative department which builds consumers perspective, trust, loyalty and emotional connections with brands.

#### **4.4 Study Area/Target Area**

This study concentrated on the urban area in Lahore, where creative managers employed for advertising agencies. These sessions gave a wide spectrum of perspectives from creative managers from varied backgrounds. The investigation was conducted at the following locations: Gulberg 2 and 3, and Cantt. The study looked at creative managers that use AI into all of their creative efforts, as well as those who give a variety of AI material in online advertising. The creative manger from less AI-adopted organisations was also present in the research, which provided equal and accurate outcomes.

#### **4.5 Target Population**

The target audience composed of creative managers from 360 advertising firms who used AI tools in their campaigns, had a minimum of three years and a maximum of fifteen years of experience in the creative department of advertising agencies, and had qualifications ranging from bachelor's to master's.

#### **4.6 Data Collection**

A non-structured checklist was applied to evaluate consumers' perceptions of online advertising's effectiveness and creativity. The open-ended questionnaire enabled participants to provide additional details about how AI is collaborating with human creativity, engaging customers, challenges and limitations of AI, concerns regarding ethics, and the future of AI in advertising.

#### **4.7 Data Analysis Tool**

The responses of creative managers were analyzed using theme analysis in accordance with Braun and Clarke (2006). The analysis was done manually to identify seven central themes along with their related sub- themes that met the aims of the study. This was done to guarantee confidentiality, accuracy, and an honest interpretation of the opinions of the creative managers.

### **5. FINDINGS**

#### ***Theme 1: Consumer Evaluation of AI vs. Human Online Advertising***

The participants represented the group of 12 creative managers; 8 upper-level managers (Synergy, Checkmate, Message Communication) and 4 junior managers (Checkmate de Studio, Time & Space), and all of them used AI-based tools. *1 out 4 junior manager stated that "A human has to provide the prompts and the better the prompt, the better the AI result will be" (C1).* The respondents noted that human ads are based on exploration, planning, and narration, which the AI ads are based on prompts and automation. Ten out of twelve managers affirmed that AI advertisements save time, money and are appealing to the eye. One of creative manager stated that *"AI is very popular right now because it's new and anything new always fascinates people for a while" (r.2).*

Eight senior managers said that human ads build stronger emotional appeal, credibility and result in more sales. AI has new advancement for creative content with lack of emotions concerns for consumers but *"No matter what kind of creative content generated by humans or Ai tools that mainly focus on driving sales through it" (C-4).* AI improves efficiency, but missing emotional depth. Human creativity remains critical to loyalty, trust, and effectiveness over the long term. *"AI ads looked like trends and eye candy right now that it will generate the sales and engagement (C-5 and C-7)".* The entire group agreed that AI

advertisements are fast, cheap, & appealing to the eye, but humans' ads tend to be emotionally engaging and result in larger sales.

### **Theme 2: Positive vs. Negative Impact of AI on Creativity**

All 12 respondents agreed in some commonality, AI advertising is efficient and attractive, they lacked emotional depth and relationship, while created by humans' ads are more appealing and emotionally impactful because they integrate actual storytelling and experiences.

The subject matter highlights both the possibilities and restrictions of artificial intelligence in creative advertising. In general, AI enables creative managers as well as creators to create various visual variations, inside shootings, and eye-catching ads without the need for large teams or outside production. *AI ads are faster, more personalized, and capable of producing many different versions at once*(C-6). Four expert respondents (BS, Masters) emphasised that AI saves time, money, and personnel, whereas four highly knowledgeable creative from two agencies claimed that AI fills outdoor shoot gaps and promotes creativity, but it cannot replace human creativity. Two of the four younger creatives (BS, Bachelor) praised AI's quickness and variety, but the other two criticised its lack of emotional connection despite inventive images.

Furthermore, six out of eight senior creative managers agreed that human-made ads build trust through psychological connection and storytelling, while AI ads appear artificial, robotic and prompt-based, lacking emotional depth.

Two managers out of eight stated that AI lacks emotion and realistic human movement without proper gestures and expressions that is why "*AI characters feel Artificial*"(C-6 and C-11). They claimed that audiences can still be effectively engaged by well-prompted AI. In general, AI improves productivity and fosters creativity, but human emotion is still crucial for brand impact and trust.

### **Theme 3: Effectiveness of AI Ads**

Creative managers argue that AI-generated advertisements have severe differences with human-created ads in terms of customer recollection and trust. The gap between long-term retention and short-term attention is evident in this theme. Senior creative (single and married) managers from all agencies agreed that the freshness, visual appeal, and modern execution of AI advertisements contribute to their high preliminary recall. One of the described that "*Human ads are long lasting memorable if think jingles like Ding Dong Bubble, Cocomo Cocomo or Dairy Milk* (C-1)". However, they warned that consumers quickly forget AI ads because they lack true storytelling, emotional depth, and cultural significance. No advertising that was entirely AI-based that stuck in their minds over time was mentioned by any of the respondents. Human-made advertisements, on the other hand, were consistently recalled for longer times period because they incorporate relevant tales, genuine emotions, and cultural values, all of which are strengthened by popular jingles and characters. They provided some memorable human creative ads like Ufone "*Tum Hi To Ho*", Dalda "*jaha Mamta waha dalda*", Zong "*Sab Keh Do*"(C-12).

The rest of the four associate creative heads (single) said that AI-generated advertisements are not as reliable as human-generated advertisements, particularly in the claims of the products. They stated that AI images are often unreal or deceptive and they are not very emotional. Human video ads, in turn, were considered to be more believable as they portray realistic storyline and actual feelings, as well as creative expression as such to these participants; AI is suitable to stationary posts or graphic designs, but less efficient when it comes to videos because it is unable to display emotions realistically.

Some respondents expressed trust issues regarding the advertisement through AI. AI possessed no real feelings, human interaction, and storytelling that were culturally centered, that is why "*AI not reliable and trust worthy until now but may in future*"(C-9) thus human-made advertisements were more realistic, credible, and successful in long-term brand loyalty and impact

Five creative managers with different experiences level share their concerns that they like Ai tools for description because Ai text polished, direct and ready to read for urban areas or young generation that is why “*Generation Z is more like to AI generated descriptions for products(r.11)*”. On other hand human text is less detailed and sometime misunderstand consumers. “*Sometimes we need creative content and sometimes compulsory accurate information depend upon the consumers prefer that fulfil requirement of situation (C-2)*”. Seven from Twelve managers shared their preference as human description was more accurate, strong originality and culture relatable for consumers that is why audience like human content more truth worthy than AI.

#### ***Theme 4: Creativity through AI-Human Collaboration***

AI is also a supporting tool that may be used to improve the customer engagement rate due to its high speed, diversified content options, reduced human involvement, and quick image creation. This topic proves that AI can make creative managers work more efficiently on behalf of clients and enhance their short-term customer engagement. The 12 participants had all a positive experience with AI tools in their workplace as professionals, highlighting how AI enables them to work smarter by using inputs based on data and fast creative output. Previously, we collected data manually, but “*AI has made our task faster, which took a month can now be completed in a week, and a week can now be done in 1–2 days*”(C-2).

Seven of the eight top managers asserted that AI enhances the speed of the job by producing rapid images, layouts and textual variants compared to the time and resources that would be required to produce advertising done by humans. They however stressed that they still need human creativity to trust, be creative and tell an emotionally charged story. Two of the 12 respondents cited the robotic production and absence of psychological guidance, which forces human editing, especially in video advertisements. The two creative managers opposed “*AI in totality because of the lack of customer trust*” (C-4 and C-9).

The majority of members believed that the implementation of AI efficiency and human emotional narratives gives the most successful results because AI reduces prices and period of production and human creativity raises credibility, loyalty, and brand value. Online advertising need blending of creativity of human minds and AI tools that generates accurate otherwise “*brands will eventually die out*” (C-8).

Six high educated respondents from 8 convince that Ai was highly effective for short term excitement like wow factor and not replaceable human emotion content for long term impact. The two state that Ai contains limit hype lived and less effective for sale and memory. Two out four (bachelor and graduate) confidently said Ai generate impossible visuals effects that remember in mind. They described in that way “*AI hype used for propaganda*”(C-7).

The most of participants from 7 out 12 favour the Chatgpt, deep seek AI and mid journey because Chatgpt is one most popular ai tool that assist the creative managers to get excellent result and provide infinity ideas and provide out of box scripts for ads creation in less time and “*ChatGPT (paid version) great for text, image generation, brainstorming, and deep research*”(C-5). Mid journey also great ai visual tool that assist to get different creative images for ads creation in short and fewer budgets than outdoor shoots. Five other creative managers use different AI tools that they think better for their work like Gemini for text, Adobe Ai for design enhancement, eleven labs for music. All 12 respondents on final review stated that, AI is regarded as a strong assistance tool that through the creation of rapid content alternatives and visuals enhances quickness, effectiveness, and short-term interest. For deep emotions, integrity, and trust, human creativity is still crucial. The best results come from fusing artificial intelligence with human storytelling.

#### ***Theme 5: Perceptions of AI Brand Honesty in Advertising***

Creative managers found AI as a valuable tool of brand engagement. AI can be work as supporting tool to increase the speed of copywriting, visuals and animation but need real emotion touch that is mostly delivered by human creative minds.

6 out of 12 creative managers (checkmate de studio, time and space) shared their opinion, AI consumers always appreciate the brands honesty when they saw AI label on ads. In coming years, policy will include the show disclaimer of “*AI content in ads that create interest of consumers for transparency*”(C-4).

It mattered for consumers when AI label on the ads of brands because “*If machines are doing all the work, my ideas will become completely dead and brand is purely AI-generated, they lose interest*”(C-6). Two out of Twelve (synergy) said that AI feel less pressure and effected from consumers when it belongs to well know brand. 4 out of 12 creative managers (message and synergy) highly recommended that ai content from new brands cause risk of brand image due robotic, emotionless and misleading content for consumers.

### ***Theme 6: Engaging Consumers through AI Innovation***

Advertisements that are developed by humans are also more likely to be believed in by consumers since they convey actual stories and connect directly with the Pakistani culture, 9 out of 12 creative executives said that advertisements based on AI will instantly attract customers but will have little effect in the long term because “*AI’s capability is always behind humans*”(r.2). Three managers stated that AI together with human intelligence will be more effective in attracting customers to the product and ensuring their loyalty. Eight respondents report that AI commercials are not bad as long as they are introduced with authoritative hints and creative manner; whereas four consider that they are not going to be accepted because of the lack of emotional appeal, imagination, and deep faking capabilities. Most of the twelve interviewees are of the opinion that “*the inclusion of human invention and AI has the potential of enhancing lifetime trust and brand loyalty*”(C-1).

It is instantaneous to draw attention, and creative managers underline the significance of human narration based on real-life occurrences and values of cultures to gain long-term customer trust and loyalty. The effectiveness of AI along with human emotion, when used together, creates attractive, authoritative, and culturally informed advertising which in fact works with consumers.

### ***Theme 7: Challenges and Limitations of AI Advertising***

They indicate that human creativity is a necessity in advertisement because AI cannot fully learn human emotions or the cultural multiplicity, and this will lead to moral issues, ill-received reactions of consumers, and the decline of brand loyalty. The backlash were faced when “*AI sometimes misses cultural and social sensitivities during campaigns of brand in target areas of country*”(C-2). Three Message managers suggested that AI is incapable of effectively executing brand-specific ideas without the involvement of a human expert. According to three Checkmate of the Studio management, AI can ignore social conventions, which causes social reaction. Although three Time and Space managers underlined that AI cannot create consumer trust due to a poor emotional bond, three Synergy managers said that AI advertisements may mislead customers and lead to trust issues.

All the respondents stated that a human approach is needed to prevent negative effects as AI cannot really understand culture, emotions, or norms. AI will not be fully replacing human advertisements in the following five to ten years as 12 managers of Lahore agencies say because human innovation is premised on emotion, context, tradition, and real experience. “*Monotonous tasks can be handled by AI, speedier operations are possible*”(C-5) and the cost reduction is essential, regardless of human ingenuity.

Five managers recommended labeling AI content to preserve its trustworthiness and brand reputation noting that excessive dependence on AI might be detrimental to uniqueness and personal feelings. Most of the respondents agreed with the principle that humans are to be in the refinement, ethical, and emotional storytelling, and “*AI can serve as an accelerant in the development of ideas, speed, and creative blocks*”(C-7). Generally, AI makes the work more effective; however, it is unable to replace the human imaginative work in advertisements.

### ***Theme 8: Ethical Considerations and future AI Advertising***

The ethical application of AI is critical to the advertising industry's long-term success. Creative managers emphasized that AI has to function inside cultural, social, and religious borders, since misuse for hype, quick sales, or deceptive brand creation can harm brand reputation, particularly for young companies. The main issue is that AI does not know the limits with global knowledge and “*should set ethical boundaries to save from misleading the consumers*”(C-9). Seven out of twelve most senior creative managers recommended agencies to treat AI with respect, to avoid deception and misrepresentation, and to utilize “*AI solely as a supporting tool*”(C-1). They also advocated the establishment of regulatory and oversight entities to combat unethical AI advertising. “*Brand should focus on the AI work as short ads effectively than human ads without emotions*”(C-2).

The other five managers emphasized the importance of explicit ethical norms, local culture education for AI systems, and stringent limits on damaging data such as deepfakes, obscene pictures, and religiously inappropriate material. The majority of respondents (9) felt that merging the creativity of people with AI results in better products by combining depth of emotion, creativity, cost efficiency, and quickness. Overall, participants agreed that AI should support rather than replace human creativity, while also providing new roles and possibilities and “*morality and cultural knowledge remaining important to advertising practice*”(C-8).

## **6. ANALYSIS**

The study investigated to see how consumers perceived the effectiveness and creativity of online advertising depending on their evaluations of artificial intelligence (AI) and human-made advertisements, positive and negative impacts of AI creativity, memory and imagination of AI ads, honesty-based content, task responsibility, creative tools, limitations, and rules of ethics that are essential for creative managers. With this goal, they were interviewed twelve creative managers and analysis showed that they were some themes:

### ***6.1 Consumer evaluation of AI vs. Human Online Advertising***

AI-generated online ads were considered by creative managers to be rapid, affordable, and appealing to viewers, making them ideal for short-term and trend-based campaigns. AI reduces manufacturing effort and time with prompt-based results, but it is usually seen as emotionally weak, missing realism and connection to culture. Human-created advertising, on the other hand, has been regarded as more planned, research-driven, and emotionally appealing because they are based on genuine narrative and audience knowledge. Due to this psychological and emotional connection, human advertisements were regarded as more trustworthy and effective in increasing customer involvement and purchases. Although AI enhances speed and facilitates creative operation, human creativity is critical for establishing confidence, emotional resonance, and future brand value.

### ***6.2 Positive and Negative Impact of AI Creativity***

AI has both useful and harmful effects on creative advertising. It makes things faster, cheaper, and quicker to make a visual but can be very shallow in terms of depth of emotion and human relationships. Ads manufactured by humans are more entertaining and believable as they are centered on the authentic plot and emotion. In general, AI is conducive to creativity and productivity, yet it takes human emotion to have a substantial marketing impact and credibility.

### ***6.3 Effectiveness of AI Ads***

The long-term effectiveness of human storytelling is higher than AI. Creative managers noted that AI advertisements are easily noticed at first with fashionable visuals and originality, but quickly forgotten because of the absence of feelings and interpersonal relations. The advertisements, developed by humans and being made on the basis of real stories and emotions, as well as familiar faces, are catchy, make people trust, and want to be involved in the process in the long term. Although AI is perfect in quick

images and brief content, good the brand, genuine communication, and lasting consumer remembrance need human innovation.

#### ***6.4 Creativity Through AI-Human Collaboration***

Creativity is enhanced by AI and association by humans. The creative managers highlighted that AI enhances productivity, creates different content within a short time, and reduces labor expenses which made campaigns less costly and fast. Nevertheless, trust feeling and important storytelling still need human creativity. According to the respondents, the most effective was a blend between the efficacy and malleability of AI and human perception and emotion in creating more interesting, more believable, and more sustainable advertising and maximizing financial resources and time.

#### ***6.5 Perceptions of AI Brand Honesty in Advertising***

Consumer trust is brought about by transparency in AI. The creative managers believe that the people will react well when the companies openly admit using AI in their advertisements. A combination of AI performance and human creativity, using AI to create images, written content, and animation and incorporating real and emotional stories leads to greater engagement and trust. The well-known brands are less susceptible, and new projects with AI as the only option may appear unnatural as well as soulless, which is detrimental to their reputation. On the whole, AI should be considered more in the role of a support tool, and the human guidance and openness should be regarded as preserving the legitimacy and consumer trust.

#### ***6.6 Engaging Consumers Through AI Innovation***

Human storytelling with references to real life events and value systems can be achieved at once with the help of AI, as creative managers stressed the necessity of gaining customer trust and loyalty through the application of true facts and values. In conjunction with human emotion, the efficacy of AI creates attractive, trustworthy, and culturally concerned advertisements that, in fact, connect with customers.

#### ***6.7 Challenges and Limitations of AI Advertising***

It is impossible to replace human creativity, considering the development of artificial intelligence. According to the claims of the creative managers, AI-generated advertisements often lack sentiment, cultural sensitivity, and even ethical consideration, which may result in mistrust towards the business, cultural backlash, and a reduction in brand reputation. As much as AI can produce content in a short time, save money, and perform automated tasks, it cannot fully reflect human circumstances, real life, or narratives, and thus requires human intervention. Managers stressed that AI can be used as an assistant in the creative process to generate creative ideas, accelerate the production, and provide a wide range of content instead of working as a replacement of human talent. Openness, naming of AI material, and human control are necessary to preserve trust, social applicability, and brand honesty. Altogether, AI enhances efficiency, yet human creativity is needed in order to make advertising effective, ethical, and socially relevant.

#### ***6.8 Ethical Considerations and Future AI Advertising***

Ethical AI advertising can enforce adherence to cultural and religious norms, avoid false or misleading statements, and avoid harmful content (deepfakes and other harmful posts) that can damage others. The senior creative managers emphasize that AI must support human talent, and the maximum results are achieved by using both human-made material and AI material to produce unique, emotionally appealing, and cost-effective advertisements. It is essential to have clear rules and regulations, surveillance and local education of AI. Although AI will enhance efficiency and generate new employment opportunities, the originality of human being remains important to achieve long-term brand loyalty and effective advertisements.

## 6. CONCLUSION

According to this study, the apparent operational advantages of using the AI-generated ads include speed, cost effectiveness, adaptability, and visual appeal which are in line with the priorities of usefulness and ease of use of the Technology Acceptance Model. However, AI does not feel, understand culture, make moral conclusions, and tell real stories, so ads created by humans can be considered trustworthy, engaging, and valuable in terms of ensuring long-term brand loyalty.

AI and human innovation are the most effective marketing results. AI can be used in copywriting, images, animation, and brainstorming, whereas human beings plan, affective storytelling, and make significant creative choices. This alliance is an enhancement of consumer experience, increased psychological attachment, and awareness of AI as a helping tool rather than a substitution.

Artificial intelligence in advertising is the most suitable option based on the promotion of the career and increase in efficiency, though it should not be implemented at the expense of integrity, morality, or human connection. In order to make ads reliable, captivating and successful, the agencies must be employing AI in an ethical manner, as per cultural and moral standards, and combine it with human creativity.

### Acknowledgements

None.

### Conflict of Interest

Authors declared NO conflict of interest.

### Funding Source

The authors received NO funding to conduct this study.

### ORCID iDs

Abdullah Zafar<sup>1</sup>  <https://orcid.org/0009-0007-5451-7012>

Sajid Hussain<sup>2</sup>  <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-7901-1735>

## REFERENCES

- Afzal, N. (2024). The Future is Here: Role of Artificial Intelligence in Medical Literature. *Journal of the College of Physicians and Surgeons--Pakistan: JCPSP*, 34(8), 1004. <https://doi.org/10.29271/jcpsp.2024.08.1004>
- Akbar, M. A. (2025). Framework for Addressing Legal Dimensions of Artificial Intelligence and Robotics Applications: A Fiqh Perspective. *Quantum Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities*, 6(1), 160-171. <https://doi.org/10.55197/qjssh.v6i1.597>
- Akbar, M. N. (2025). Use of artificial intelligence tools by doctoral students: a mixed-methods explanatory-sequential investigation. *Journal of Further and Higher Education*, 1-19. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0309877X.2025.2515135>
- Amankwah-Amoah, J., Abdalla, S., Mogaji, E., Elbanna, A., & Dwivedi, Y. K. (2024). The impending disruption of creative industries by generative AI: Opportunities, challenges, and research

- agenda. *International Journal of Information Management*, 79, 102759. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijinfomgt.2024.102759>
- Blakeman, R., & Taylor, M. (2022). Teaching about the Evolving Agency Relationships between Project Managers, Creative and Account Service. *Journal of Advertising Education*, 26(1), 19-34. <https://doi.org/10.1177/10980482211072295>
- Cetindamar, D., Kitto, K., Wu, M., Zhang, Y., Abedin, B., & Knight, S. (2022). Explicating AI literacy of employees at digital workplaces. *IEEE transactions on engineering management*, 71, 810-823. <https://doi.org/10.1109/TEM.2021.3138503>
- Chen, C. (2022). Study on the innovative development of digital media art in the context of artificial intelligence. *Computational Intelligence and Neuroscience*, 2022(1), 1004204. <https://doi.org/10.1155/2022/1004204>
- Dinker, N. (2024). Artificial intelligence and inequality: examining the social divides created by technological advancements. *International Journal of Innovations in Science, Engineering and Management*, 228-236. <https://doi.org/10.69968/ijisem.2024v3si2228-236>.
- Ezzat, R. (2024). Enhance the advertising effectiveness by using artificial intelligence (AI). *Journal of Art, Design and Music*, 3(1), 1. <https://doi.org/10.55554/2785-9649.1021>
- Gao, D. K., Haverly, A., Mittal, S., Wu, J., & Chen, J. (2024). AI ethics: a bibliometric analysis, critical issues, and key gaps. *International Journal of Business Analytics (IJBAN)*, 11(1), 1-19. <https://doi.org/10.4018/IJBAN.338367>
- Gu, C., Jia, S., Lai, J., Chen, R., & Chang, X. (2024). Exploring consumer acceptance of AI-generated advertisements: From the perspectives of perceived eeriness and perceived intelligence. *Journal of Theoretical and Applied Electronic Commerce Research*, 19(3), 2218-2238. <https://doi.org/10.3390/jtaer19030108>
- Hasija, A., & Esper, T. L. (2022). In artificial intelligence (AI) we trust: A qualitative investigation of AI technology acceptance. *Journal of Business Logistics*, 43(3), 388-412. <https://doi.org/10.1111/jbl.12301>
- Hunt, J., & Kerr, D. (2025). The hybrid formula: The essential role of human creativity in AI-generated advertising. *Journal of Brand Strategy*, 14(1), 30-42. <https://doi.org/10.69554/NBYX9041>
- Kang, H., & Lou, C. (2022). AI agency vs. human agency: understanding human–AI interactions on TikTok and their implications for user engagement. *Journal of Computer-Mediated Communication*, 27(5), zmac014. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jcmc/zmac014>
- Mhlanga, D. (2020). Industry 4.0 in finance: the impact of artificial intelligence (ai) on digital financial inclusion. *International Journal of Financial Studies*, 8(3) <https://doi.org/10.3390/ijfs8030045>
- Nayab, D., & Bilal, A. (2025). AI-Driven Immersive Experiences in Pakistani Cultural Narratives. *Human Nature Journal of Social Sciences*, 6(2), 193-203. <https://doi.org/10.71016/hnjss/9e7tae11>
- Palinkas, L. A., Horwitz, S. M., Green, C. A., Wisdom, J. P., Duan, N., & Hoagwood, K. (2015). Purposeful sampling for qualitative data collection and analysis in mixed method implementation research. *Administration and policy in mental health and mental health services research*, 42(5), 533-544. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10488-013-0528-y>
- Safdar, G., & Zaheer, A. (2025). Greenwashing in TV Advertisements: Measuring Audience Trust and Awareness of Misleading Eco-Claims. *Print, Radio, TV and Film Studies*, 6, 1-14. <https://doi.org/10.71016/prtfs/wyt6za62>

- Sestino, A., & De Mauro, A. (2022). Leveraging artificial intelligence in business: Implications, applications and methods. *Technology Analysis & Strategic Management*, 34(1), 16-29. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09537325.2021.1883583>
- Shabir, G., Ghous, S., Safdar, G. (2017). Violation of Consumer Rights by Electronic Media Through Advertisements. *New Media and Mass Communication*, 57, 35-39.
- Sharma, A. J., & Rathore, B. (2024). Examine the enablers of generative artificial intelligence adoption in supply chain: a mixed method study. *Journal of Decision Systems*, 1-33. <https://doi.org/10.1080/12460125.2024.2410030>
- Sharma, G., & Lal, R. (2024). Assessment of the Efficacy of Artificial Intelligence-Generated Versus Human-Generated Images in Digital Advertising. *Cahiers Magellanes-ns*, 6(2), 8112-8122. <https://cahiersmagellanes.com/index.php/CMN/article/view/1356>
- Singhal, N., Garg, P., Goyal, S., & Mishra, N. (2025). *Green Banking with AI: Cutting Edge Innovations for Sustainable Financial Solutions*. *Climate Risk and Emerging Markets: Valuation, Volatility, and Portfolio Strategies* <https://doi.org/10.1108/978-1-83708-088-520261037>
- Trattner, C., Jannach, D., Motta, E., Costera Meijer, I., Diakopoulos, N., Elahi, M., & Moe, H. (2022). Responsible media technology and AI: challenges and research directions. *AI and Ethics*, 2(4), 585-594. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s43681-021-00126-4>
- Wu, L., & Jing Wen, T. (2021). Understanding AI advertising from the consumer perspective: What factors determine consumer appreciation of AI-created advertisements?. *Journal of Advertising Research*, 61(2), 133-146. <https://doi.org/10.2501/JAR-2021-004>